

GATEWAY CORRIDOR ALTERNATIVES: DRAFT Updated Evaluation of Alternatives September 17, 2012

Point Assignment + = 10 points O = 5 points - = 0 points	TIER 1 GOALS					TIER 2 GOALS					Overall Ranking
	Goal 1: Improve Mobility (30 points total)			Goal 2: Cost Effective, Economically Viable Option (20 Points total)		Goal 3: Supports Economic Development (20 points total)		Goal 4: Protect Natural Environment	Goal 5: Preserve Community Quality of Life	Goal 6: Safety	
	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts	10 pts total	10 pts total	10 pts total	
Daily Transitway Ridership ¹	Transit Travel Times ²	Traffic Impacts	2019 Capital Cost (CEI) ³	Operating Costs	2010 Population & Employment	Station Area Development Potential (2030 Population & Employment, # of Stations, Station Location)	Impact Avoidance/ Minimization & VMT Reduction	Estimated Property Acquisitions	Ungated, At- Grade Crossings ⁴		
3 – BRT along Hudson Rd/I-94 <i>OPTIMIZED</i> -Length = 11.7 miles -Exclusive Guideway -Stations = 5 walk-up, 5 Park & Rides (P&Rs)	+	+	O	+	O	+	+	+	O	+	High (85 points)
	9,300	17 minutes from Oaks Station, Oakdale	No change in local street access; no lane reductions	\$404M (Note: CEI for 6 and 9 minute constant = \$52/\$46)	\$9.6M	Pop. = 25,722 Emp. = 15,088	Pop. = 29,933; Emp. = 20,012 10 stations Stations all at street level		<10 full, 80 partial property acquisitions		
5 – LRT along Hudson Rd/I-94 <i>OPTIMIZED</i> Length = 11.7 miles Exclusive Guideway -Stations = 5 walk-up, 5 P&Rs	+	+	O	O	-	+	+	+	O	+	Medium (75 points)
	9,300	15 minutes from Oaks Station, Oakdale	No change in local street access; no lane reductions	\$922M (Note: CEI = \$84)	\$11.5M	Pop. = 25,722 Emp. = 15,088	Pop. = 29,933; Emp. = 20,012 10 stations Stations all at street level		<10 full, 80 partial property acquisitions		
8 – BRT Managed Lane <i>OPTIMIZED</i> Length = 14.4 miles -Managed Lane shared with auto uses -Stations = 2 walk-up, 5 P&Rs	+	+	+	O	O	O	-	+	+	+	Medium (75 points)
	8,100	11 minutes from Radio Drive, Oakdale/Woodbury	Improves I-94 LOS in Segment 2	\$523M (Note: CEI = \$67)	\$8.9M	Pop. = 15,683 Emp. = 13,608	Pop. = 19,120; Emp. = 16,842 7 stations Stations all within freeway median		<10 full, 10 partial acquisitions		
2-TSM <i>OPTIMIZED</i> -Length = 9 mi. Mixed Traffic and Shoulder running -Stations = 7 P&Rs	-	+	O	+	+	O	-	+	+	+	Low (70 points)
	3,000	14 minutes from Guardian Angels, Oakdale	No changes	\$27M (TSM is basis for CEI of build alternatives)	\$4.5M	Pop. = 12,420 Emp. = 7,943	Pop. = 15,139; Emp. = 11,505 7 stations Stations all at street level		None		
4 – BRT along E 7th/White Bear Ave/Hudson Rd -Length = 13.3 miles Exclusive Guideway -Stations = 7 walk-up, 6 P&Rs	O	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	-	O	Low (50 points)
	5,800	26 minutes from Oaks Station, Oakdale	Lane reductions & fewer left turns in E. St. Paul	\$468M (Note: CEI for 6 and 9 minute constant = \$51/\$46)	\$10.8M	Pop. = 41,061 Emp. = 20,630	Pop. = 46,675; Emp. = 28,780 13 stations Stations all at street level		80 full, 330 partial acquisitions		
6 – LRT along E 7th/White Bear Ave/Hudson Rd Length = 13.3 miles Exclusive Guideway -Stations = 7 walk-up, 6 P&Rs	+	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	O	Low (45 points)
	10,100	23 minutes from Oaks Station, Oakdale	Lane reductions & fewer left turns in E. St. Paul	\$1.1B (Note: CEI = \$87)	\$14.8M	Pop. = 41,061 Emp. = 20,630	Pop. = 46,475; Emp. = 28,780 13 stations Stations all at street level		90 full, 350 partial acquisitions		
Ranking Criteria	+ >8,000 O 4K – 8000 - <4,000	+ Faster than 18 min O Equal to 18 min - Less than 18 min	+ No changes to street access/cap. & improves I-94 LOS O No changes to street access/cap. & no change I-94 LOS - Changes to street access/cap. & no change I-94 LOS	+ \$0 - \$500M O \$500M - \$1B - > \$1B	Annually + > \$5M O \$5M - \$10M - > \$10M	+ >25k pop., >15k emp. O 10-25k pop. 5-15k emp. - < 10k pop., < 5k emp.	+ >25k pop., >15k emp., >10 stations, all stations outside of freeway O 10-25k pop., 5-15k emp., 10-15 stations, some stations within freeway median - < 10k pop., < 5k emp., <10 stations, all stations within freeway median	Acres of impact (wetlands, water bodies, floodplains & parklands) + < 50 acres O 50 – 100 acres - > 100 acres	+ <25 full, <50 partial O 25-50 full, 50-100 Partial - >50 full, >100 partial	+ < 15 crossings O 15 – 50 crossings - > 50 crossings	

- Boardings on BRT or LRT at stations and boardings on express buses using the guideway.
- Transit travel time compared to an 18 minute projected auto travel time during 2030 AM peak period between the Crossroads/Oaks Business Park Station in Oakdale(or comparable location) and Union Depot.
- The Cost Effectiveness Index (CEI) is a Federal Transit Administration (FTA) metric currently used to measure incremental cost per hour of transportation system user benefits in the forecast year. The CEI will be replaced by a new metric under MAP-21 Surface Transportation Bill.
- Consistent with Hiawatha implementation, local street intersections are ungated, increasing the potential for interaction with traffic, pedestrians and bicycles